**Reviewing younger in age and service police officers: What are the implications for the organisation?
1: Introduction**

The Police Uplift Programme involves the recruitment of over 50k new officers. Initial analysis of the available demographics of new officers suggests that they are younger in age than previous recruits into the police. Whilst the limited research reviewing the implications of younger in service and age workforce specifically in policing is acknowledged, this review sought to establish what there is available currently that might support a better understanding of the issues by drawing on a selective, wider literature about age profiles across a range of industries and sectors. Central to the success of this programme is ensuring that police force areas have the infrastructure in place to support the new recruits in order to retain and motivate them in their new roles. Some limited evidence on the implementation of direct entry schemes into policing suggests that the current workforce can feel responsible for the new officers in operational contexts because of their perceived lack of time and experience in service. This caused current officers to question the extent to which the new officers could make effective decisions without the operational experience perceived as essential within the policing role (Williams et al, 2020). Therefore, the literature review was commissioned to ascertain any evidence available that would enable an effective understanding of having a younger in age, and in service, workforce. This knowledge and the subsequent recommendations will enable the development of an effective strategy to support forces in terms of recruitment, retention and learning and development.

The research questions were:

What are the organisational implications of having a young (in age and service) workforce?

What interventions have been identified as being useful to support a younger workforce?

This report is presented in five sections. Section two outlines the methodological approach taken for the literature review, section three explores the themes arising from the review of the literature available and section four addresses these in the context of the research questions. The final two sections outline the conclusions and recommendations derived from the current available knowledge.

**2: Methods**

The broad aim of the study was to examine the literature to ascertain the current evidence-base available on what effect the changing age and service profile of police officers will have on how the police operates?

Search Strategy

The search strategy for this narrative review was to retrieve any peer-reviewed and ‘grey’ literature, articles / reports that were relevant to examining the changing age profile in a police setting. The scope of the study was limited to police organisations only as opposed to all industries due to the short-time scale for delivering the research. Four electronic databases were searched for titles between 2005 and 2021: Criminal EBSCO Host, PsychInfo, Scopus and Google Scholar. It was anticipated that the level of academic Titles would be limited. Therefore an additional search strategy was deployed that examined not peer-reviewed, grey literature. This included hand searching UK and US consultancies or think-tanks with a known interest in policing. EThOS and ProQuest-Thesis was also interrogated for post-graduate dissertations and theses. This was supplemented with a generic Google (e.g. not Google Scholar) search for titles which was limited to the first 15 pages.

The search terms used key characteristics of a younger work force supported by Boolean operators “AND” with “OR”: “police recruitment”, “graduates and policing”, “graduates and retention”, millennials and retention”, “younger workforce”, “organisational demography”, “organisations and millennials / Generation Z” “future workforce” and “developing millennials / Generation Z”, “experience and policing”. The latter search term was included as a result of the core function that ‘experience’ has in policing. There was an identified need to think broadly about the impact of a younger workforce both in terms of their expectations / development and retention; also the impact a lack of knowledge ‘build up’ might have on policing and the current officers in other ways; and the impact of the proportions of older and younger elements in a workforce. For example, study abstraction and the perceived resilience to the frontline provided by the current workforce, subsequent wellbeing and CPD for serving staff could be important (Williams et al, 2020).

The approach was altered in two instances from the initial commission. First, following an initial search based on titles relating solely to the UK, the search was broadened to include English-speaking countries such as North America, Australia, and New Zealand. It was determined that this may reflect the nearest similar approaches to policing to the UK and reflect where work on this topic may have already been undertaken. Second, the process of website scanning yielded a group of non-peer reviewed titles. Adams et al. (2016) deploys a tiered system for selecting articles related to its likely value to the research question, where the highest Tier (1) has the highest overall quality and Tier 3 the lowest. Our initial search strategy proposed accessing only the highest Tier which related to government and consulting or think-tank reports/White Titles. After reviewing the lower tiers (2 and 3) which included newspaper or magazine articles and blogs, it was decided to include these discussions if relevant to the topic. The decision to include these sources were in response to the limited evidence-base and, it was noted that a number of these articles were written from a position of knowledge (for example, by serving police officers).

Study Selection

2,098 titles were located through searches of academic, electronic databases with an additional 12 articles located through web focused website scanning or a generic Google search. These titles were screened using the abstract or title summary based on inclusion and exclusion criteria (Table 1). The retrieved citations were screened and ordered using Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses (PRISMA) guidelines (Figure 1). Of the 2,110 titles identified 2,049 were excluded because they did not meet the inclusion criteria. Of the 61 titles that were screened for inclusion, 10 were excluded at the second stage of the process (full-text review) leaving 51 valid titles. 15 titles were grey literature, 14 academic Titles, 9 online magazines or newspaper articles, 7 theses (Masters, DBA, PhD), 4 conference or seminar Titles and 1 blog. Most Titles were from the United States (n=45) with eleven from the UK, three from Canada and one from Australia/New Zealand.

**Table 1:** Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Inclusion** | **Exclusion** |
| Between 2005 and 2021 | Before 2005 |
| Published in English  | Non-English language titles |
| Examining English-speaking countries only | Non-English language speaking countries |
| References to workforce planning in a policing-context with reference to age | Workforce planning not policing-specific or related activities |
| Workforce planning in related occupations to police e.g. criminal justice settings |  |

Quality Appraisal

The titles were appraised using a Weight of Evidence (WoE) approach as summarised by Gough et al. (2007) that provides an overview of quantitative and qualitative methods. Gough et al (2013) provide an assessment across three domains: relevance, appropriateness of methods and the quality of execution of these methods. These three domains are aggregated to derive a single WoE ‘score’ based on ‘high’, ‘medium’ or ‘low’. Placing non-peer reviewed Titles into these domains proved problematic as grey literature tended to be less concerned with methodological robustness. Therefore, many grey literature titles were scored based on the relevance to the topic and this may overstate its importance relative to academic Titles. Using this method nine Titles were graded as ‘high’, 25 scored ‘medium’ and 17 ‘low’.

**Figure 1:** PRISMA Flow Diagram



Data Synthesis

The findings from the titles were synthesized using recommendations for a narrative synthesis in line with Popay et al. (2006). The results from this approach were captured visually using mapping methods advocated by Arksey and O’Malley (2005). Each study was numbered 1-51 and used as a cross-reference as each theme emerged.

The first phase focused on establishing themes by sorting the data into groups by creating a visual map. Labels were created to describe links between themes and lower-order sub-themes which were nested within themes. This allowed for the visual clustering of similar data. The approach was checked and validated by the two researchers. As issues were mapped, the researchers established the relative importance of each emerging theme. This was determined by the frequency in which a title mentioned an issue within a theme and the importance or relevance to the research question. This created an informal ‘weight’ to place onto each issue as it was grouped into a theme. We have attached an annotated bibliography at the end of the report as they provide the reader with more detail of the sources used and a summary of the main arguments presented in the Titles.

The identified themes from this synthesis are outlined in the following section.

**3: Thematic findings**

***Traditional cultural considerations: The old meets the new***

Police learning

Policing in the UK in terms of the College of Policing’s professionalisation agenda and the subsequent standardisation of education and training through the Police Education Qualification Framework (PEQF) has gone through vast change over recent years. Whilst the landscape in the US – where much of this literature is from – is fundamentally different there are some key learning points from the evidence review that confirm the need to see new officers as iterative, adult learners whose continuous development and learning is blended with their operational experience in the workplace. This is essentially what the Police Constable Degree Apprenticeship aspires to achieve through the staged learning process and the attachment of new officers to tutor constables for the purpose of putting their learning into a practical context.

Titles (11,19,25,32,33,40,45,50) advocated ‘mentoring’ to engage and support younger officers[[1]](#footnote-2). This was considered to allow for the development of a collegiate and supportive environment where officers feel valued. Mentoring in this capacity allows for the interaction between newer recruits and longer serving officers to facilitate discussion and support (for example, to provide an informal ‘sounding-board’ to discuss practical work and related issues). This approach advocates the notion of newer recruits as adult learners and promotes a policy of ongoing education and development (supported by current officer mentoring). In this context formal training and educational learning is iterative with an expectation that expertise is derived from the accumulation of the academic learning and the build-up of experiential knowledge (16,45,50). Additionally, critical thinking skills and enhanced communication skills were considered important particularly when considering police as role models across diverse communities. Given the desire for ongoing personal growth and development police training should reflect this shifting perspective (2, 9).

Recognising younger officers' preference for transparent and more linear leadership

Leadership is a current area of focus in policing and whilst reviews of police leadership literature in terms of best or promising practice as often inconclusive (Pearson-Goff and Herrington, 2014) there are links here to the recommendations found in the UK literature on organisational justice and policing (Bradford and Quinton, 2014) and the work on situational leadership in policing (Davies, 2019).

Five studies (2,5,11,24,28) specifically discussed (in a US context) whether traditional policing that focuses on training recruits using paramilitary-style command-and-control leadership techniques are optimal for younger officers in terms of retention and motivation. Indeed, this has featured more recently in the UK in resignations from police officers (29). Titles (6,11,18,50) argue that younger officers have a preference for flatter organisational structures with greater transparency in the decision-making process that also includes creating an environment for discussing policy and strategic decisions. The literature suggests that this may create a tension with older officers who have a career history of working within hierarchical command-and-control structures, where flatter, more collegiate approaches may be considered an anathema. A subset of the literature focused on an apparent need for younger officers to receive ‘excessive praise’ compared to other generations of officers. Plus this related to less ability to receive criticisms (4,7,24,31). Indeed, this sense of value is linked to the literature on police wellbeing and job motivation in the UK context and supports the need for officer ‘health’ to be considered as central within the supervisory process (Hesketh et all, 2016) for new recruits.

A commitment to public service

The Police Federation Pay and Morale Uplift November Report (Police Federation, 2020) illustrates that 92% of new recruits state that they are proud to be police officers. There is strong evidence from this review that younger police officers are more comfortable with diversity, share the ideals and values of public service and a desire to undertake an activity that is considered a vital community-focused service. This finding is consistent across all generational groups (7,31,63,45,50). There is also a suggestion of a shift in younger police officers placing greater value on concepts of public service relative to traditional concerns of financial or job stability.

Moreover, cross-sectional surveys (mainly North American) suggest that younger officers are broadly satisfied in their roles compared to other age-groups and that any differences in satisfaction levels are marginal (14,23,24,39). The literature does suggest however, that younger officers are less committed to the organisation than older generations (24,27,28,39,49). Despite a lack of organisational commitment, age is not seen as a prognostic for an intention to leave suggesting that staff turnover may be a function of other factors such as leadership, work-life balance (3,22,29). This finding runs contrary to the wider human resourcing literature that shows turnover and turnover intention are higher in a younger workforce but that this declines with age and family commitments. This may suggest that police officers have made some psychological commitment to the police force and the public service focus at this stage.

***Wellbeing and work life balance***

The onset of the pandemic in the UK has fundamentally changed the way organisations approach flexibility in the workplace. This includes the police. The titles reviewed argued that younger officers (often defined as ‘Millennials’) had specific needs that may be perceived as antagonistic to current policing methods. A strong theme identified in the Titles was for younger officers’ preference to ensure a strong work-life and wellbeing balance (7,11,15,16,23,25,28,31,36,40,50). A number of these titles discussed the possible tension between a ‘long-hours’ culture and the need to maintain a balanced approach to their employment that may affect attitudes to future job retention.

***Harness the skill base***

Other features included the need for recruits and younger officers to develop interpersonal or life-skills (‘personal qualities’) to manage the complexities of modern policing (9,12,19,45). A greater emphasis on these skills was viewed as important to navigating the role of police in supporting “social welfare”. Here, it was perceived that wider social, partnership and collaborative skills are required to forge relationships with individuals and bodies outside of traditional policing such as public/mental health or voluntary organisations (28,36,45). This is important at a time in the UK when there is a drive to align law enforcement more with public health approaches as a result of changing agendas on vulnerability, mental health and social problems. Indeed, this would harness the commitment new officers have for public service and a less militaristic police environment.

In addition, titles highlighted younger officers’ knowledge of technology (‘tech savvy’) through the use of mobile technology and social media (11,25,36,40). This was considered an advantage in that younger officers will consider technological changes and advancement such as big data / algorithm usage more favourably compared to other age groups. However, it was also suggested that this may be a source of tension where the ubiquity of younger people’s online presence may require careful management and monitoring. In relation to potential misconduct this is an important finding.

***Recruitment and Retention of Younger Officers***

The North American literature highlighted the need to develop new recruitment approaches to ensure younger people are motivated to join the police and then be retained over time – in the UK this forms part of the new entry process for policing developed via the implementation of the PEQF and drive for continuous development. The literature related issues of recruitment to the context of a perceived US ‘crisis’ in recruitment as older police officers are retiring in large numbers and they have not been replaced by younger officers. Similarly, retention in a UK context has also been problematic over recent years.

Enhancing recruitment processes

For many commentators, there was a desire to streamline the hiring process by reducing the time taken to complete recruitment and make it more efficient (10,21,32,36,46,50). To complement recruitment, continuous approaches to support the candidate were advocated including the development of a ‘customer support’ function that allowed for feedback to be incorporated into the recruitment process (10,16,21). A continuous cycle of review and evaluation of the recruitment and retention process was recommended (10,26,32,49,50).

A major component of enhancing the recruitment process was the need to develop more sophisticated approaches in relation to the internet and social media that made the offer more attractive to young people (13,17,23,27,43,46,50). This method was considered useful for engaging younger people at an earlier stage to develop a future recruitment pipeline as well as offering interaction with people to address recent criticisms of policing activities. Considering this in the context of UK policing and the recent negative media coverage this option to consider the ‘reality’ of police work before joining is an interesting idea. This approach was considered to have potential to assist with the recruitment of more diverse candidates to ensure that the police are representative of local communities. This includes minority groups and women (21,28,36,45,50).

Other mechanisms for bolstering recruitment and interest from younger people included developing formal pathways from schools, colleges and universities often by incorporating policing into standard curricula (10,17,19,23,50). Other suggestions included ‘ride-alongs’ to provide hands-on experience of police business (10); using off-duty police as ‘informal recruits’ to advertise the service to family members and friends (16); involvement of parents as part of the recruitment process (50) and creating internships similar to other public and private institutions (40).

**Conclusions**

In terms of applying these findings and themes to the UK there are a number of programmes already established which align with the findings outlined in this paper. The UK have recognised, through the PEQF and subsequent curriculum, the need for officers coming into policing to be upskilled in critical thinking, community awareness and communications and problem solving. However, this learning needs to be considered, in the context of these findings, alongside the new typology of officer coming into policing. The research indicates that officers now have a commitment to public service, maybe more ‘liberal’ in their views at the point of entry into the police and have a desire to understand and communicate more effectively within diverse community settings. More broadly, given the current climate and the narrative about policing aligning itself more with public health, public value, early intervention and recognising where to divert people from the criminal justice system, this drive needs to be nurtured. This approach can be linked to wider developments in the HR literature that suggest in order to recruit a younger workforce there is a need to engage with a ‘story’ (e.g narrative), purpose (bottom-up approaches) and ‘activities’ that illustrate the culture of an organization (Pritchard, 2018). Moreover, the findings suggest that enhancements to recruitment can be made to minimize wastage throughout the process. This can link to the wider human resourcing literature that suggests diverse personality types amongst younger people are engaged through differential recruitment channels (Linnehan & Blau, 1998).

Therefore, as indicated in the findings the role of supportive supervision and the ability for ‘mentors’ or tutor constables to facilitate the learning being gleaned through academic input into practice is central to this learning approach. This would reflect the fact that the new officers are adult and iterative learners who require ongoing development through a learning approach. In the UK there is anecdotal evidence (Williams, 2018) to suggest that current police officers acting in tutor constable roles have not been given the appropriate skills to support this blended learning approach to police education. It is here that the first point of tension arises between maintaining that desire for learning in new officers and the current police culture that values and rewards time in the job and experiential knowledge over external knowledge that comes from outside the police (Williams et al, 2020). This has implications for the organisation in terms of both retaining new recruits and the possibility of bringing new critical learning and thinking into a police service that is operating in a complex environment. This is particularly important if the police are committed to establishing a more problem solving approach to dealing with wicked issues. This is needed to move this commitment from rhetoric to real change. There may be an opportunity to develop an enhanced approach to mentoring and coaching as derived from the wider human resourcing literature (cf. Clutterbuck, 2008).

Charman’s work (2017) mirrors this perspective from the other viewpoint – that of the new officers. They clearly articulated in her research that they perceive themselves in many ways, as different to the traditional officer who is embedded in a particular style of police culture. Research in Australia, undertaken by Chan (1997), found similar results. New officers are socialised into culture via their organisational police tutors where they can receive advice to forget what they have learnt from their education and listen to the narrative of those already in the job. This sense of reality check can indeed influence the onset of cynicism and therefore risks losing the insights and different perspectives that new officers offer the service.

This is further compounded by the review findings about leadership styles and the desire for more open and transparent styles from the new recruits. Given the leadership input that officers might experience in the police curriculum, if this is not accorded with what they experience when they arrive in service this dissonance could impact on their perceptions of the organisation. Far from the traditional command and control style these new officers value the importance of inclusivity and flatter structures. This highlights the need for new officers to understand the need for adaptive, situational leadership styles dependent on the context of the situation and, conversely, the need for those in leadership roles to be encouraged to be more participatory in their approach with new officers . Indeed, research will confirm that officers are more likely to follow the direction of their leaders in different contexts if they broadly feel they are trusted, valued and included in decision making (Bradford and Quinton, 2014). This is a theme within this review and given age was not considered here as a prognostic to leaving the police getting leadership right is central to retaining these new officers.

Over the pandemic the police have become far more adaptive to flexible working which has enabled a more balanced work and life experience for many officers. Whilst the implementation of flexible workplace options is complex and needs to be developed strategically with the needs of the individual as central to it (Kossek et al, 2016), this change in working practice is seen as paramount for the new officers. The acceptance of society to discuss the need for balance and wellbeing is clear particularly over recent years in policing (Hesketh and Cooper, 2016). There is much work being conducted on this area and yet anecdotally the shift in police culture to move this from simply a narrative to a reality for officers is not consistent (Williams et al, forthcoming).

The critical cultural tensions between the new officers and traditional culture act as barriers to their acceptance from the current workforce in the UK context – this has been experienced in the context of direct entrants (Williams et al, 2020). There are clearly some very progressive strategies being established in the UK for new recruits around blended learning, immersive learning tools and a drive to educate officers about crime, vulnerability, criminality and the impact of the social contexts in which these occur. This review suggests, to prevent new officers feeling that they have to adapt into the current culture in order to ‘get on’, the current workforce need to understand the skills that new officers might offer the police service if it genuinely wants to change and adapt. The skills the new generation offer around understanding the social context of crime, public value, community and police relations and technology needs harnessing or there is a real risk that retention will become problematic and investment in these officers will be lost.

**Recommendations**

The authors appreciate that these recommendations are resource and time intensive. However, they are relevant and central to both meeting the needs of the new recruits and ensuring that knowledge and experience is captured within the organisation as the time in service reduces within police organisations. The recommendations are written thematically based on the core findings of the review.

**Addressing cultural considerations: Where the old meets the new**

1: **A commitment to Continuous Development –** Iterative and continuous learning is essential for motivation and valuing new staff. There are various formal and informal methods that may facilitate this process and create an enhanced learning environment more generally within the organisation for current and new officers:

* Create peer networking / mentoring sessions for new and current staff. Build the time in for the sharing of knowledge based on ‘real life examples’ where experiential knowledge can be discussed in the context of the taught curriculum to encourage a breaking down of the barriers between the old and new traditions.
* Consider establishing leadership Q and A / reflection workshops to encourage visibility and dialogue with new officers.
* Invite new recruits to reflective debriefs / case reviews. Encourage dialogue and input from new officers to help them consider their learning in practice and enhance it through mapping it on to experience and real-life events.
* Use the process of reflective practice to identify learning needs and career path requirement.
* Invite experts in to discuss core topics and offer them to all staff.
* More strategically there needs to be a commitment to the ongoing learning strand of the PEQF for current officers and more drive from the College of Policing about ongoing learning for both new and current officers.

**2: Upskilling of tutor constables** – given the cultural tensions identified in these findings there is a clear risk attached to the loss of recruits educational learning if tutors lack an understanding of the role and aim of different knowledge being introduced through the PCDA and PEQF. Whilst this is a risk to new officers being able embed their learning at a practical level there are additional risks around fairness and development for the tutors themselves. This could be done in the first instance by making content from the PCDA university partners accessible for the workforce if this can be negotiated.

3: **Consider methods to share and manage current knowledge –** retention is not simply about retaining people but also retaining the expertise and knowledge they bring to the workplace. Capture learning through debriefs / reviews / evaluations and create a repository for this institutional knowledge to be captured and shared. This should be owned by learning and development departments.

4: **Ensure a transparent and fair approach to the use of social media –** The younger generation are more likely to be users of social media. There needs to be a national strategy for officers’ use of social media including Twitter which is clearly articulated to all staff. Individual force policies and procedures for social media are confusing for new officers. Disciplinary action as a result of social media usage needs to be understood and considered in context.

**Harness the changes the new recruits present to the police organisation.**

1: **Encourage and support local police force areas to develop an organisational people strategy** that covers wellbeing, reward, recognition, mentoring plans and development. Within this strategy clear details for flexible working options should be outlined. There are opportunities to learn from the flexibility that resulted from the pandemic to identify potential options for flexible working practices in different roles.

2: **The implementation of a social contract** would operationalise the people strategy. The contracts should be managed via human resources and would serve to align the expectations and obligations of the organisation and the employer. Broadly this agreement could include details of the organisation’s mission or values that the new officer is signing up to and subsequently, the factors that the organisation will put in place to ensure the officer can deliver on this mission. This includes: the offer of manager/supervisor support; access to wellbeing processes; the process of learning and development for the officer and details on the opportunities for flexible working which are clear and fairly distributed. This would need to be developed through dialogue rather than being controlled by the line manager in order to give the officer a ‘voice’ within that process. Centrally, the provision of an implementation team could assist with the development and delivery of these contracts.

**Leadership**

1: **Check your organisational health via the staff survey results and ensure visibility when listening to and actioning the findings from the surveys –** Surveys can inform leaders about culture / staff satisfaction and staff ‘buy-in’ and commitment to the organisation. Training or input for leaders on organisational justice would enable more reflection on the findings and encourage the production of action plans to ensure officers understand that their voice is being listened to and heard.

2: **Ensure that interviews are conducted with leavers and identify themes –** this knowledge is key to understanding the organisation and where strategies and action plans need review based on the evidence. This illustrates to officers that their voices are being heard and valued.

3: **Create a feedback / communication strategy** to inform the workforce of what you are doing about the issues raise including face to face input from the leadership team.

**Ideas for further research**

1: Systematic review mon broader human resource literature within other related sectors.

2: Undertake tutor constable research to assess challenges to the role and conversely where current work is impacting positively in forces.

3: Intergenerational research to capture the experiences and perceptions of the new recruits and the perceptions of them from current officers with longer time in service.

**Study Strengths, Limitations and Challenges**

A strength of this study was the inclusiveness of a range of grey literature including utilising sources usually outside the scope of an academic literature review such as PhD theses, studies from police officers undertaking leadership training, online trade magazine and blogs. This may be considered relevant as many of these sources are from serving police officers and may be seen as an important representation of ‘views from the ground’. A number of theses whilst not peer-reviewed, have been overseen by Universities and some of this work is of a high calibre. We have cross-referenced the findings to the wider human resource literature where relevant, although it is recognized that a more detailed review of the comparisons between human resourcing in policing and in other industries was not possible in the timescale.

The review has a number of limitations. The majority of titles are from the United States and therefore not entirely comparable with the UK. The focus on English-speaking forces may artificially exclude from our analysis more equivalent forces to the UK (such as from Europe). The enhanced use of grey literature has included a high number of ‘low’ quality titles that are either largely descriptive or based on the personal views of the author(s). As described above, the difficulty in translating a quality appraisal method used for academic Titles may not be appropriate for grey literature and may overstate the importance of some titles. A number of titles have described intergenerational differences in general terms. For example, the ‘millennial’ group now includes people up to early middle-age (40 years). A number of theses deployed interesting cross-sectional survey designs to describe differences between different age-groups which lead to differences as a function of age (as younger officers are less likely to be in a senior role and are more likely to undertake more routine activities). In other words, the empirical analyses are unable to comment on longitudinal changes. The differences reported across generations may be because new recruits are by definition young in age (with attitudes that change once in the workforce longer), and it is not possible to determine whether this is actually a permanent cohort shift. Some of what is described has been known in the HR literature for some time and has been seen as age not cohort related. We advise some caution in the use of this information when describing inter-generational differences as moderators such as seniority and task assignment are not incorporated. This may overstate differences such as organisational commitment, satisfaction levels and other psychological factors.

**References**

Adams, R. J., Smart, P., & Huff, A. S. (2017). Shades of grey: guidelines for working with the grey literature in systematic reviews for management and organizational studies. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, *19*(4), 432-454.

Arksey, H., & O'Malley, L. (2005). Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 8(1), 19-32.

Bradford, B. and Quinton, P. (2014) ‘Self-legitimacy, police culture and support for democratic policing in an English constabulary’, *British journal of criminology*, 54(6): 1023–1046

Chan, J. B. L. (1997) *Changing police culture : policing in a multicultural society.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Charman, S. (2017) *Police Socialisation, Identity and Culture*. Cham: Springer International Publishing AG

Clutterbuck, D. (2008). What's happening in coaching and mentoring? And what is the difference between them?. Development and Learning in Organizations: An International Journal.

Davis, C. (2020) ‘Rank Matters: police leadership and the authority of rank’, *Policing & society*, 30(4): 446–461

Gough, D. (2007). Weight of evidence: a framework for the appraisal of the quality and relevance of evidence. *Research Titles in education*, *22*(2), 213-228.

Hesketh, I., Cooper, C. and Ivy, J. (2016) ‘Wellbeing and Engagement in Policing: The Key to Unlocking Discretionary Effort?’, *Policing : a journal of policy and practice*, 11(1)

Kossek, E. ‘Implementing organizational work-life interventions: toward a triple bottom line’, *Community, work & family*, 19(2): 242–256

Linnehan, F., & Blau, G. (1998). Exploring the emotional side of job search behavior for younger workforce entrants. Journal of Employment Counseling, 35(3), 98-113.

Pearson-Goff, M. and Herrington, V. (2014) Police Leadership: A Systematic Review of the Literature, *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 8(1): 14–26.

Police Federation (2020), Police Federation Pay and Morale Uplift November Report.

Popay, J., Roberts, H., Sowden, A., Petticrew, M., Arai, L., Rodgers, M., ... & Duffy, S. (2006). Guidance on the conduct of narrative synthesis in systematic reviews. A product from the ESRC methods programme Version, 1, b92.

Pritchard (2018), Reaching a Younger WorkForce, *Leadership Excellence*, March 2018, 37-38.

Williams, E., Norman, J. and Boag-Munroe, F. (2021) ‘Direct Entry: Fairness, resilience and the impact on regular cops’ *International Journal of Law and Criminal Justice.*Vol 64

**Appendix 1:**

**Annotated Bibliography of sources used in the review**

Source 1: Fairley, A (2020a) A networked approach to policing

Source type: Blog

Aims: Considers recruiting 20,000 new police officers

Design and methods: Author’s own views

Location: UK

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Argues that recruiting 20,000 officers is a “once-in-a-generation opportunity”. Argues for following military recruitment (‘Karmarama’) that uses “data analytics” to recreate the right-fit for the police.

Limitations: Viewpoint from a consultancy with a commercial interest in police recruitment.

WoE: Low

Source 2: Gary, M. (1992) 'Police Recruits: Training Tomorrow's Workforce' *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin 19*. Vol 61(3)

Source type: Magazine article

Aims: Changes to police training practice

Design and methods: Author’s own views

Location: US

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Argues that traditional police training is borrowed from the military (‘stress training’) and this may not be fit for purpose for newer breed of recruits who can be viewed as ‘adult learners’. Moreover, suggests that using stress training only encourages recruits to “emulate all the negative aspects of their role models as police officers on the street.” Argues for critical skill thinking; enhanced communications as role models across diverse communities. Author cites a change in US police recruits priorities from salary and security to “self-expression, self-fulfillment, and personal growth.” Argues that police training should reflect this shifting perspective.

Limitations: Operational stakeholder’s perspective – how representative the US training structure is in the UK is a key question.

WoE: Low

Source 3: Allisey, A. F., Noblet, A. J., Lamontagne, A. D., & Houdmont, J. (2014). Testing

model of officer intentions to quit: The mediating effects of job stress and job

satisfaction. *Criminal Justice and Behavior*, 41(6), 751-771.

Source type: Academic Paper

Aims: Examine stress, job satisfaction and intention to leave service amongst police officers

Design and methods: Cross-sectional survey of n = 1,789 police officers (response rate = 25%), completed in 2012.

Location: UK

Data from: NA

Sample details: Operational Police Officers in the UK. Shown to be broadly representative of the wider UK police force.

Summary/ Findings: Job demands, peer support (stress); autonomy, relationships, job clarity (stress, job satisfaction), manager support (job satisfaction). Job stress and job satisfaction associated with intention to quit. Age was not a significant prognostic for any model.

Limitations: Low survey uptake (25%) although it can be argued that the sample surveyed are broadly representative.

WoE: Medium.

Source 4: Barlag, S. M. (2016). Retaining the millennials: how excessive praise produces failure.

Source type: Grey Literature/Think Tank Report

Aims: Examines how to retain millennials within police force structures.

Location: US

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Author argues that “excessive praise during childhood has created a higher level of narcissism and a sense of entitlement in the Millennials”. It is argued that excessive praise cannot diminish effectiveness within hierarchical structures. Author suggests that millennials are viewed as “job hoppers” (p8). It is argued that “the Millennial officer must be taught the nuances of the workplace and given a framework in which to operate”

Limitations: Non-peer reviewed paper. Relates wider academic literature on workforce to US police environments. Unclear whether police recruits differ from wider millennial traits.

WoE: Low.

Note: Perspective seems to be that millennials need to fit into police culture.

Source 5: Belur, J., Agnew-Pauley, W., & Tompson, L. (2020). Designing a graduate entry route for police recruits: lessons from a rapid evidence assessment of other professions. *Police Practice and Research*, 21(2), 134-151.

Source type: Academic Paper

Aims: Examines how to retain millennials within police force structures.

Location: US

Data from: NA

Sample details: Rapid Evidence Assessment from 51 studies on designing a graduate entry programme derived from law, teaching and social work

Summary/ Findings: Argues that graduate training programmes should incorporate four themes derived from other disciplines: student learning styles, the integration of theory and practice, teaching methods and assessment. Argues that there should be a shift away

“from the traditional Para militaristic model of training that perpetuates the hierarchical

nature of the organisation and the cultural expectation of unquestioning obedience to authority” (p146)

Limitations: Based on descriptive studies, lack of information on trainers and studies reviewed did not have sufficient data on drop-outs.

WoE: Medium.

Note: Difference in emphasis (compared to Source 5) where police should amend their training to graduates’ expectations.

Source 6: Chevremont, M. J. (2019). Millennials in policing: Recommendations for reshaping the workplace to recruit and retain millennials in law enforcement.

Source type: Seminar Paper

Aims: Examines how to recruit millennials within US police. Uses Herzberg’s Two-Factor Theory of Motivation as a framework.

Location: US

Data from: Literature review

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Author argues that millennials have specific concerns and that traditional police structures, police culture, and police leadership work are antagonistic to these values. The author argues that “flattening” police structures, creating an inclusive work environment, and implementing transformational leadership would help motivate millennials encourage policing as a profession. The author is cautious about the conclusions: “flattening” a structure may not be possible operationally and may not be what communities wish for (in terms of community accountability). Interesting paragraph – “For example, older generations believe that new people should bide their time at the bottom of the rank structure, stay quiet, and do as they’re told. Millennials prefer actions and behaviors that are in direct contradiction. Millennials want rapid advancement, to be part of a team that has a say on important decisions, and questions authority” (p33) Argues that multigenerational training is needed to counteract potential conflict. Suggests that police unions may see organisation change as a threat and destabilise change. Argues for a more nuanced understanding of millennials preferences for those: (a) in service; (b) in training; (c) contemplating a police career.

Limitations: Does state limitations in the paper including broad generalisations of the characteristics of millennials. The author deploys a ‘Theory of Generations’ to address this but is cautious in its use in that there is likely to be sub-groups of millennials rather than a single defining characteristic (p30). Argues that whilst there is an occupational literature on workforce preferences for millennials this is not the case for law enforcement.

WoE: Medium-High.

Source 7: Cox, G. M. (2012). Crisis in police recruitment: Public service motivation and changes in generational preferences.

Source type: PhD thesis.

Aims: Examines why there has been a perceived recruitment problem in the US.

Location: US (North Texas)

Data from: Two surveys: (a) 132 professionals associated with policing and (b) 1,001 servicing police officers

Sample details: Age coded into groups: Traditionalist, Baby Boomer, Generation X and Generation Y (the youngest group)

Summary/ Findings: Police officers motivated by sense of duty and to a lesser extent money and job security. Most groups are similar in outlook apart from Gen Y and are more concerned over work-life balance. Argues against small local campaigns for national efforts aimed at duty and service. Suggests that the recruitment process is too long for Gen Y and reliant on newspaper advertisements. The author argues for more interactive web-based portals to speed up recruitment. There is a cut and paste of other studies recommendations which are taken as the author’s on pages 82-83. Argues for specialist training for Generation Y officers including “praise” (see Source 5)

Limitations: Limited to North Texas in the US. Recommendations largely cut and pasted from others.

WoE: Medium – makes some useful observations in terms of recruitment time.

Note: Definitions of generations – also uses phrases such as” Generation Me” includes Generations X and Y.

Source 8: Economist (2017), The force is weak. Police departments struggle to recruit enough officers

Source type: Magazine article.

Aims: Discusses recruitment within US police forces

Location: US

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Highlights Baltimore PD lowering age; educational limits to encourage recruits. Article does not comment further.

Limitations: Limited analysis offered.

WoE: Low.

Source 9: Hilal, S., Densley, J. A., & Jones, D. S. (2017). A signalling theory of law enforcement hiring. Policing and Society, 27(5), 508-524.

Source type: Academic Journal.

Aims: Uses signalling theory (a means to distinguish between high and low quality candidates)

Location: US (Minnesota)

Data from: Senior police officers

Sample details: 31 interviews with senior police officers in Minnesota.

Summary/ Findings:

Issues with: (a) underlying quality of candidates. Argues that millennials lack interpersonal skills, need to ensure candidates had sufficient integrity and honesty; (b) signalling – evidence of volunteering; completion of a 4-year degree; previous experience; and methods of (c) screening of candidates. Authors argue that differential signals for ‘baby boomers’ (recruiters) and millennials (candidates) result in different interpretations of what high-quality means: “This means that pre-service education needs to do a better job of informing Millennial candidates about the realities of police work and what ‘high quality’ candidates

look like to an agency” (p519). Considers pre-screening at universities and colleges prior to formal recruitment processes. Authors argue in favour of taught courses prior to recruitment on the development of critical thinking, conflict resolution, public speaking, and interpersonal communication skills. They also argue in favour of raising the age threshold to 23 years and an increased emphasis on “life experience” (p520).

Limitations: Limited to one US state.

WoE: High.

Notes: Use of signalling theory and interesting perspective.

Source 10: Oliver, P. (2016). Hiring for the 21st Century Law Enforcement Officer: Challenges, Opportunities, and Strategies for Success. History and Government Faculty Presentations. 190.

https://digitalcommons.cedarville.edu/history\_and\_government\_presentations/190

Source type: Grey Literature.

Aims: Discusses recruitment across US police forces

Location: US

Data from: Round table/panel discussion of key stakeholders

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: List of recommendations at the end of each chapter and in conclusion.

Final chapter offers oversight of main areas including relevant issues such as: (1) reducing recruitment time; (2) continuous hiring programmes e.g. that allow people to join in a civilian capacity until formal recruitment has been initiated; (3) a ‘customer services’ process that supports candidates through the recruitment process; (4) inclusion of “ride-alongs” (p60) to observe potential candidates in real-world situations; (5) focus on physical fitness; (6) specialised pathways into the police from local schools and colleges;

Limitations: US based only.

WoE: High.

Source 11: Hubbard, T. (2019). Millennials: Adapting Police Recruiting and Supervision Practices.

Source type: Grey Literature/Police Leadership Document.

Aims: Specific policy paper at recruiting and managing millennials

Location: US

Data from: NA

Sample details: Literature review.

Summary/ Findings: Argues ‘baby boomers’ are workaholics but later generations place a high value on work-life balance. Gen-Y are more self-reliant with millennials more likely to require positive affirmation. Millennials viewed as more up-to-date with technology and more supportive of ‘team-work’ but despite this willing to “challenge tradition” (p6). Author highlights potential for conflict in hierarchical organisations. Author argues for less didactic approaches to supervision in favour of more coaching/mentoring approaches.

Limitations: Generalisations applied to whole cohorts.

WoE: Medium.

Note: Includes definitions of different generations (some difference compared to other definitions used elsewhere?)

Source 12: Huey, L., Peladeau, H., & Kalyal, H. (2018). There's more than one right path to the destination: Does degree type make difference in police recruiting. *Journal of*

*Criminal Justice Education*, 29(3), 399-413

Source type: Academic Journal

Aims: Examination

Location: Ontario, Canada

Data from: 32 police recruiters.

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Criminal justice or criminology degrees not associated with recruitment, rather an emphasis is given to “skills and personal qualities” (p411).

Limitations: Limited to applicants with a degree.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 13: Helldorfer, Kelly Lee, ""I Can Haz Applicants": An Analysis of Police Recruitment and Marketing Through Social Media" (2016). Master's Theses. 266. https://aquila.usm.edu/masters\_theses/266

Source type: Masters thesis.

Aims: Police recruitment through social media

Location: US

Data from: A “netnography” of police websites

Sample details: 500 randomly selected police websites across the US.

Summary/ Findings: Argues that social media and the internet are not being used effectively as a recruitment tool

Limitations: Argues that age was not analysed – suggests a need to undertake similar analyses with age as a prognostic.

WoE: Low.

Notes: The analysis is unable to determine whether social media or internet presence leads to more and improved levels of candidates.

Source 14: Sharp M. (2016), Job Satisfaction in Law Enforcement Officers According to Generational Cohorts.

Source type: PhD thesis.

Aims: Whether generational cohorts (Baby Boomers, Generation X, and Millennials) have a relationship with job satisfaction, organizational commitment, age, and the performance of policing duties

Location: A two “Midwestern city police departments” in the US (p48)

Data from: Cross-sectional survey

Sample details: 194 serving police officers

Summary/ Findings: Overall majority of officers regardless of age are satisfied in their roles, although millennials have the lowest scores overall. The analysis casts doubt on millennials occupational commitment to the police (relative to other generations) although some the difference may be explained by seniority and task assignment.

Limitations: Small number of baby-boomers limited any firm conclusions. Likely confounding effect due to age and task assignment.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 15: Mason, M. L. (2016). Recruiting, hiring and retaining qualified law enforcement officers.

Source type: Grey literature/ Police Leadership Document.

Aims: Broad analysis of recruitment and retention across the US.

Location: US

Data from:. Literature review

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Article suggests that Millennials are “team oriented, intelligent, cooperative, technology driven, and interdependent” and in comparison to Generation X, millennials may be more focused on traditional family values. It is suggested that Millennials are financially aware and seek a comfortable, relaxed work environment with the opportunity for rapid upward mobility. Article suggests that financial indebtedness and obesity have affected recruitment in the US as a whole.

Limitations: US focused an transferability to non-US settings.

WoE: Medium.

Source 16: Langham B. (2017). Millennials and Improving Recruitment in Law Enforcement.

Source type: Online magazine.

Aims: Specifically aimed at recruiting millennials into the police.

Location: US

Data from: Largely derived from a RAND review of police recruitment in the US

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: The article suggests that bottom-up policy making is advocated as is a family-friendly workplace and therefore creating space for a work-life balance was considered optimal. Additional strategies could include off-duty family functions, on-site and off-site childcare, allowing officers to take lunch breaks at home, and allotting time and space for families to visit with officers during their lunch breaks. ‘Internal factors’ include ensuring sufficient budgets are set for recruitment and that progress in the recruitment process is being monitored, use of police officers as informal recruiters (e.g. recruiting family and friends) which could be incentivised. The article argues for enhanced presence on the internet with mass media campaigns that highlight the public service component of policing. The recruitment process could be enhanced through ongoing contact through the process from initial application to acceptance and reduce the time taken to complete the process. The article recognises there are limits to salaries but suggests incentives can be created such as ongoing education etc. Article also highlights the negative impression of policing through recent US scandals and suggests a greater media profile that highlights policing as providing a community service

Limitations: Largely a review of the RAND findings.

WoE: High.

Source 17: Harmon R (2011)., A New Approach In Recruiting & Retaining Qualified Officers At The Bella Vista Police Department.

Source type:. Grey literature

Aims: Discuss broad recruitment drive with a focus on minorities and women within one specific local US police department

Location: Bella Vista Police Department, Arkansas, US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Enhance website, offer incentives, team up with local universities to integrate policing with curricula.

Limitations: Very localised study.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Notes: Very personalised analysis of local recruiting need.

Source 18: Petersen, J. (2020). Recommendations for retention strategies in correctional agencies in order to decrease staff vacancies with a specific focus on younger generations of candidates.

Source type:. Seminar Research Paper

Aims: Focus on recruitment of correctional staff (e.g. non-policing)

Location: US

Data from: Literature review

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Argues consistent finding for corrections and refers to policing. Has a section (pp22-24) on generational differences. Notes that younger officers want to have their voices heard. Argues that millennials are likely to be more educated than other generations and want “their time spent in universities to count for something” (p37).

Limitations: Corrections focused

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 19: Huey, L., Kalyal, H., & Peladeau, H. (2017). Preparing police recruits of the future: An educational needs assessment.

Source type:. Grey Literature (Government Report)

Aims: To understand educational needs of police officers.

Location: Ontario, Canada

Data from: Mixed methods study

Sample details: 33 interviews with key stakeholders.

Summary/ Findings: Broad recommendations on improving police-related components into university curricula including specific recommendations that aim to increasing analytical

and critical reasoning skills; effective communication, team work, leadership and ethics; courses to include from e-learning and simulation/role play exercises to student placements, professional mentorships and internships

Limitations: Very focused on one area in Canada.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 20: PWC, Policing in a networked world

Source type:. Consultancy Report

Aims: Broad based discussion of policing including recruitment needs

Location: UK

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Provides a case study of ‘Police Now’ that introduces a graduate recruitment programme. Section on recruitment provides a general overview and suggests that police recruitment should be representative of the local population.

Limitations: Limited discussion.

WoE: Low.

Source 21: Taylor et al. (2006), Cop Crunch: Identifying Strategies for Dealing with the Recruiting and Hiring Crisis in Law Enforcement

Source type: Grey Literature.

Aims: Examines extent of hiring issues across US

Location: US

Data from: National (US) Survey of just under 1,000 agencies; phone interviews; secondary analyses of other data sources.

Sample details: National survey of police forces.

Summary/ Findings: Many local US police have limited resources for recruitment - different recruitment practices were noted in relation to the size of force (larger forces more likely to recruit minorities etc.). Larger forces reported longer time periods as part of the recruitment process. The analysis noted that most forces did not provide reference materials to support the recruitment process. The authors cast doubt on the idea of a ‘cop crunch’ at a national level although they acknowledge some forces have had considerable difficulties. They also note difficulties in recruiting sufficiently qualified candidates. Increases in female and ethnic minority candidates were noted, with increases in female recruitment linked to areas with a requirement of a degree.

Limitations: US context; analysis based on overall changes in recruitment with a focus on females and minority engagement.

WoE: Low

Source 22: Lynch & Tuckey (2008), The police turnover problem: fact or fiction? Policing: An International Journal.

Source type: Academic Journal.

Aims: Examines extent and nature of police turnover across Australasia.

Location: Australasia (Australia and New Zealand)

Data from: Police turnover statistics across 4 financial years.

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Argues that police turnover lower in policing in comparison to other public sector agencies (but higher when compared to the public sector internationally). Female officers more likely to leave with a peak of those aged 25-39 years.

Limitations: Non-UK based study.

WoE: Medium

Source 23: Cain (2020), The Present and Future Law Enforcement Workforce: A Generational Comparison of Motivators for Entering and Remaining in the Profession

Source type:. PhD thesis.

Aims: Examination of generational cohorts attitudes to policing in Central Florida.

Location: US

Data from: Survey of sworn police officers.

Sample details: 99 (41% of the total).

Summary/ Findings: Participants divided into baby boomer, Generation X, millennial. Millennials and Generation X were shown to be satisfied in their choice of career with no statistically significant difference between generations. Millennials were also shown to value ‘leadership’ and ‘on the job training’. Comparing salary, benefits, career advancement and work schedules, the analysis suggested that career advancement and work schedules were prognostics for greater satisfaction in the role for millennials. Sense of mission in serving their local community was the “most prominent” (p78) prognostic of satisfaction for millennials. The author also highlights use of social media as part of the recruitment process and suggests developing links to local schools and colleges to establish a “farm system” (p82) to recruit applicants (essentially a pipe line for future, qualified applicants).

Limitations: Limited sample size including limited sub-group numbers for comprehensive analysis.

WoE: Medium.

Source 24: Lauer (2020), The impact of Police Officer Age on Leadership and Workplace Preference

Source type:. PhD thesis.

Aims: Examined police officer characteristics in terms of workplace and leadership characteristics.

Location: US.

Data from: Survey of police officers

Sample details: n=160

Summary/ Findings: Significant findings were noted between officer age and demand reconciliation in leadership (this is leadership qualities that reduce chaos and bring order to the system); younger officers were shown to be less trusting in police leadership and have lower levels of organisational commitment; significant levels across all generations for intrinsic, extrinsic and general job satisfaction. Argues for transformational leadership styles who are approachable and less militaristic in manner to appeal to millennials; for a transparent approach to developing policy that allows for questions; praise is seen as important

Limitations: US-focused.

WoE: High.

Source 25: Strensland (2018), Police Administrators should prepare their departments for the millennials.

Source type:. Grey Literature/Leadership White Paper.

Aims: Argues in favour of a clear strategy on preparing millennials for police work..

Location: US.

Data from: Literature review.

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Argues millennials are more tech-savvy which would be considered a benefit for police forces through smarter use of technology to support crime/policing. More attractive work-life balance measures are advocated such as utilising a “buy-back” approach that allows staff to buy time off. The author highlights a mentoring approach for younger police officers but acknowledges this requires resourcing including training for supervision. Highlights the lack of experienced supervision if current trends in police recruitment continue.

Limitations: Discussion piece with limited empirical evidence.

WoE: High.

Source 26: Skibba (20198, Recommendations for Law Enforcement Retention Practices and the Impact of Generational Differences

Source type:. Seminar Paper.

Aims: Examines generationally-based approaches to police retention by comparing approaches from other relevant bodies such as public or private sector organisations. It has an explicit focus on smaller forces in the US which are seen to have issues with retention.

Location: US.

Data from: Literature Review.

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: It recommends two strategies: to meet employee needs and build motivational factors across segments; continuous evaluation of retention practices; continuous assessment of new employees; and supportive leadership.

Limitations: Specifically aimed at smaller US police forces.

WoE: Medium.

Source 27: Vargas (2014), Modifying Police Recruitment and Retention Practices: Strategies to Address the Millennial Generation

Source type: Grey Literature/Leadership White Paper

Aims: To understand what strategies are required for the recruitment and retention of millennial police officers.

Location: US

Data from: Literature review

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Argues millennials differ from other generational groups (e.g. more likely to leave to find more engaging work). Suggests technology should form recruitment strategies (e.g. through instant messaging, video conferencing etc.). The paper highlights a shift in social values in this group - single, lifetime employer a thing of the past. Highlights millennials are more likely to come from non-traditional backgrounds including greater numbers of female recruits. Argues that police forces can be viewed as businesses and greater education of recruits would reflect this perspective. Also points towards the US military as a model to emulate.

Limitations: Lacks empirical evidence for some of the assertions made; US focused.

WoE: Medium

Source 28: Wilson (2017), Articulating the dynamic police staffing challenge, Policing: an *International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*. 35(2); 327-355.

Source type:. Academic Paper.

Aims: Summarise the literature on police recruitment and retentions.

Location: International.

Data from: Literature review.

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Suggests some generational differences in retention such that younger officers may be more likely to leave. There is an argument that policing is facing a reduced pool of qualified candidates as other more attractive opportunities are being sought where rapid promotion can be achieved compared to the police Author suggests recruitment is too generic with little tailoring done for specific markets e.g. women or minorities. Makes the point that policing is now seen to include being “knowledge brokers, social service referrers, or problem-solvers” (p335). This may create disparities between actual job and expected roles for police officers. The paper highlights generational differences in culture such that younger people are less attracted to militaristic-style opportunities. Younger people are seen to prefer work-life balance. The paper highlights three areas of increased demand in the future: (a) increase in community policing; (b) homeland security; (c) emerging/new crimes. The author argues in favour of relaxing rules that would exclude candidates from tattoos to minor drug infractions; a better understanding of the work environment and its relation to different age groups. There is a need for better and ‘smarter’ management information of police officers’ progression

Limitations: US focused but with wider applicability.

WoE: High.

Source 29: Charman, S. and Bennett, S. (2021), Voluntary Resignations from the police service: the impact of organisational and occupational stressors on organisational commitment; *Policing and Society*  DOI: [10.1080/10439463.2021.1891234](https://doi.org/10.1080/10439463.2021.1891234)

Source type:. Academic Paper.

Aims: Understand the extent and nature of voluntary resignations from police services.

Location: England and Wales.

Data from: Cross-sectional survey.

Sample details: Resignations from November 2014 - 2019 (n=46).

Summary/ Findings: Resigning police officers value the work they have undertaken, public service ambitions and working as part of a team. Reasons for leaving include struggling to cope with increased demands made of them, lack of ‘voice’/leadership/autonomy and support.

Limitations: Limited by no examination of reasons for leaving by age (largely due to small sample size).

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 30: Wyllie (2018), How the Bond between Cops and Kids Might

Help Solve the Police Recruitment Crisis.

Source type:. Online magazine article.

Aims: Discusses possible approaches to solving police recruitment.

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Argues in favour of formal programmes and informal approaches aimed at encouraging young people (e.g. of school age) to perceive police in a positive light.

Limitations: Lacks empirical evidence to underscore issues raised.

WoE: Low.

Source 31: PoliceOne.Com (2017), Recruitment & Retention Crisis: The Struggle to Hire – and Keep – Good Cops

Source type:. Online magazine article.

Aims: Discusses attracting millennials into policing

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Highlights diverse nature of millennial intake (more likely to be educated and ‘liberal’). This group are more likely to emphasise work-life balance requirements. Article focuses on concerns that millennials are more likely to be “job hoppers”. Argues that the police should: Respect an employee’s desire for a work/life balance; Foster a sense of purpose; Provide varied and impactful opportunities; Provide recognition as a matter of course; and to create an environment of advocacy and trust.

Limitations: Presents wider workforce patterns are directly applicable to policing.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 32: McKay (2017), Law Enforcement Facing Unique Challenges in Recruitment and Retention of Officers, Government Technology Magazine

Source type:. Online magazine article.

Aims: Discusses attracting younger people into policing.

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Highlights alternative careers for young people may be more attractive. Article advocates continuous improvement through training to maintain pool of older police officers that can provide supervision and support for younger officers. Paper advocates streaming the recruitment process to prevent attrition.

Limitations: Presents wider workforce patterns are directly applicable to policing.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 33: Washington Post (2018), Who wants to be a police officer? Job applications plummet at most U.S. departments.

Source type: Newspaper article.

Aims: Discusses decline in applicants wanting to be a police officer across the US.

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Negative public perceptions of policing in the US including convictions of service police officers have had a direct effect on people wanting to join the police. Suggests easing of the recruitment criteria (e.g. minor drug infractions), mentoring and developing specific approaches for women and minorities may be effective. Argues in favour of recruiting to involve the whole-family.

Limitations: Limited discussion.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 34: Rough (2018), Why Police Departments Are Facing Recruitment Problems

Source type: Online magazine article.

Aims: Discusses

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: Suggests low pay; disqualifications; lack of physical fitness and credit worthiness al contribute to a decline

Summary/ Findings: Limitations: Limited discussion on reasons for recruitment problems in the US only - not age specific although assumptions are made in the article.

WoE: Low.

Source 35: Ra’oof (2014) Expanding the Qualified Candidate Pool to Meet Police Recruitment Challenges: A Multiple-Case Study

Source type: PhD thesis.

Aims: Discusses how to expand the candidate pool in San Jose, California

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: 8 in-depth qualitative interviews

Summary/ Findings: Police should be innovative to encourage people into the police.

Limitations: Limited sample.

WoE: Low.

Source 36: Police Executive Research Forum (2019), The Workforce Crisis, and What Police Agencies Are Doing About It

Source type: Grey Literature

Aims:

Location: US.

Data from: US mainly but includes UK as a case study.

Sample details: 412 sample survey of police officers and focus groups of serving police officers. Findings drawn from a conference in Washington, USA.

Summary/ Findings: From their own survey, several points are made: (1) Fewer people are applying to become police officers; (2) High levels of attrition before retirement age; (3) older police officers are now eligible for retirement. The report argues that it is not just a question of more recruiting, it is also recruiting individuals who are comfortable with technology; be able to deal with a wide range of social problems - “interpersonal communications, problem-solving, basic technological expertise, critical thinking, empathy, and “community-mindedness” (p9). The report argues that for recruitment, police forces should emphasise “service over excitement” (p10) - the public service ethos rather than stereotypical perceptions of policing based on media representations; be honest about what policing actually entails; more intensive and personal recruitment processes including candidates hearing from operational police officers; align incentives to staffing requirements - these are listed: “a diversity of assignments; opportunities to learn and develop new skills; more flexible scheduling to support a desirable work-life balance, including time for family responsibilities; regular and more frequent promotional exams; and having mentors to turn to” (p10). The report also argues for a rethinking of traditional career trajectories such that shorter-term assignments may be considered. Twelve recommendations are provided: (1) Monitor work demographics; (2) Community engagement to build trust; (3) Build police officers who are comfortable with the changing wider social role for policing; (4) Accept a younger workforce will require more training and support; (5) recruit candidates from non-traditional backgrounds who have the needed skills; (6) encourage recruitment of a more diverse workforce; (7) Recruitment messages should be based on reality of policing; (8) Streamline recruitment process; (9) Greater use of exit interviews; (10) Encourage professional development; (11) Meet Work-Life balance and wellness needs; (12) Rethink ‘old ways’ of doing things.

Limitations: Limited empirical evidence; US-focused

WoE: High

Source 37: Paterson, C. (2011) Adding value? A review of the international literature on

the role of higher education in police training and education, *Police Practice and Research*, Vol 12:4:286-297.

Source type: Academic Paper.

Aims: To understand how higher education adds value to policing.

Location: International.

Data from: Literature Review.

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Argues that police professionalism, accountability and legitimacy are all facilitated by collaboration between police and higher education bodies.

Limitations: Not age-specific or directly focused on generational needs.

WoE: Medium.

Source 38: Akin (2020) Multigenerational Perceptions Of The Law Enforcement Work Environment

Source type: PhD thesis.

Aims: Examination of differential generational perceptions to policing.

Location: US

Data from: Survey of active members of the FBI National Academy Association (FBINAA) who were also graduates of the FBI National Academy (FBINA).

Sample details: 411 responses.

Summary/ Findings: The results from the survey suggested that Millennials perceive their work environment more emotionally disturbing and having to relate to people’s personal problems has a more negative effect on them than reported by Baby Boomers and Generation X participants; Millennials perceive to have less influence on work assignments than Baby Boomer and Generation X. Millennials less informed than Baby Boomers and Generation X on decisions, changes, or plans

Limitations: Some issues with sampling e.g. oversampling of MidWest. Does not adjust for assignment, grade/position. Likely some of the factors attributable to Millennials are a function of grade.

WoE: Medium.

Source 39: Sharp (2016), Job Satisfaction in Law Enforcement Officers According to Generational Cohorts

Source type: PhD thesis.

Aims: Examination of generational factors in relation to policing.

Location: A “Midwestern city police department” (p48) in the US.

Data from: A cross-sectional survey.

Sample details: 194 (64%) responses.

Summary/ Findings: The survey suggests that most officers regardless of age were highly satisfied. Author argues that Millennials have low occupational commitment. Millennials have lower satisfaction with opportunities for promotion when compared to Baby Boomers/Generation X officers.

Limitations: Small numbers in the Baby Boomer cohort. Issues with cross-sectional designs aimed at identifying inter-generational differences.

WoE: Low.

Source 40: Jensen et al (2013), Leading Our Most Important Resource: Police Personnel Issues in the Year 2020

Source type: Grey Literature.

Aims: Forecast of police personnel issues.

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details:

Summary/ Findings: Identifies three main drivers: (1) technological change; (2) retirement of Baby Boomers and recruitment of Millennials; (3) limited resources available. The report advocates for enhanced recruitment practices so that policing is sufficiently attractive to millennials and other target groups including use of internships or “summer camps” (p7); enhance police training to use latest technological methods; to retain staff the authors advocate rotational programs, mentoring, flexibility, and policies that achieve work/life balance. Argues that Millennials also are good team players and value/contribute to feedback. Makes the point that Millennials are so ingrained into the internet, that this could have implications for policing (e.g. aspects of an officer’s personal and private life that get posted on the internet). The authors argue for mentoring and point toward the possibility of inter-generational tensions

Limitations:

WoE: Medium

Source 41: Stapleton (2013), Servant Leadership in Today’s Law Enforcement and the Millennial Generation

Source type: Grey Literature/Leadership White Paper

Aims:

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: Literature Review.

Summary/ Findings: Uses the concept of ‘servant leader’ which is a person “with the internal attributes to want to serve and the desire to lead” (p2). This concept is linked to “participative leadership” styles involves officers to set goals, solve problems, team building etc., but retains the final decision making authority. The paper argues that millennial generation perceive policing differently, and have high expectations which may result in high attrition.

Limitations: Lack empirical evidence.

WoE: Medium-Low.

Source 42: Roe (2020), Effective Officer Retention Practices: A Systematic Review

Source type: Masters thesis.

Aims: Understand effective approaches at minimising attrition

Location: International

Data from: Literature Review

Sample details:

Summary/ Findings: Argues that police forces should harmonise their mission and values with the leadership allowing for the recruitment of candidates to support those values

Limitations:

WoE: Medium.

Source 43: Sylvester (2007), Police Recruitment in Today’s Environment

Source type: Grey Literature/Leadership White Paper.

Aims: To examine recruitment practices.

Location: Texas, US.

Data from: Literature Review.

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Argues that there is a lack of sophistication in the recruitment process with an over-emphasis on the utilization of other forms of visual media to include television, billboards or mobile advertisements.

Limitations: Largely focused on observations from one police force in the US.

WoE: Low

Source 44: Moore (2017), Searching for Recruits: Understanding the New Generation of Potential Rural Police Applicants.

Source type: Masters thesis.

Aims: To explore motivations of university students and how rural police organizations can match these goals

Location: Canada

Data from: University students from a “Western” University

Sample details: 317 responses

Summary/ Findings: Using person-organization (P-O) fit theory the analysis found that young people who are considering a career in the police were no different from other students. Older students were more likely to prefer more rural police stations; the remote nature was seen to affect work-life balance; recruiting to rural positions would result in candidates accepting lower pay.

Limitations: Transferability from a rural Western Canadian setting.

WoE: Low.

Source 45: Bolton (2005), Policing Matters: Recruitment, Training and Motivation

Source type: Grey Literature.

Aims: Broad examination of police recruitment and training

Location: UK

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA.

Summary/ Findings: Argues that recruitment should include a greater emphasis on “basic decency, streetwise savviness, common sense, practical intelligence, courage and integrity” (p127); suggests a need for a graduate entry scheme which does not prioritise high achievers; argues training does not prepare police for the realities of the job; nationalised system at odds with local needs; shortage of “tutor constables” for on-the-job training; lack of incentives for good policing; issues with the social welfare task given to police; identifies problems with leadership and management. Report highlights inability to attract younger and abler recruits

Limitations: General overview of recruitment, no specific mention of generational preferences.

WoE: Low.

Source 46: Wilson (2009), Police Recruitment and Retention in the Contemporary

Urban Environment

Source type: Conference Paper.

Aims: Broad recruitment needs in the US

Location: US.

Data from: Conference participants

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Advocates recruiting that emphasises “selflessness, patriotism, and community orientation” (p22); emphasis on the “brand”; streamline recruitment processes; newer means of advertising;

Limitations: Frontline experiences in the US may not be transferable to the UK.

WoE: Medium.

Source 47: White, M. D., & Escobar, G. (2008). Making good cops in the twenty-first century: Emerging issues for the effective recruitment, selection and training of police in the United States and abroad. International Review of Law, Computers & Technology, 22(1-2), 119-134.

Source type: Academic Paper

Aims: Issues relating to recruitment and training of police.

Location: International.

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Authors argue that countries need to be proactive in recruiting; emphasis required on higher and continuous training/education; “practical, scenario-based

and realistic” (p131) training; greater understanding of local community diversity; trained in technological innovations.

Limitations: Broad-based review of recruitment, no focus on generational aspects to recruitment.

WoE: Medium.

Source 48: Hur, Y. (2017). Does training matter in public organizations? Assessing training effects in the US law enforcement agencies. International Journal of Organization Theory and Behavior.

Source type: Academic Paper

Aims:

Location: US.

Data from: 464 U.S. law enforcement agencies.

Sample details:

Summary/ Findings: Retention is associated with longer and more intensive training programmes.

Limitations: Transferability from US setting.

WoE: Low

Source 49: Wilson (2010), Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium

Source type: Grey Literature LINK TO SOURCE 35

Aims:

Location: US.

Data from: 4

Sample details:

Summary/ Findings: Generational elements discussed (p8) but largely focuses on younger recruits more likely to leave. Argues in favour of ongoing analysis of staffing including demographic demands; realistic job previews; enhance compensation and other benefits; greater employee engagement, including efforts to increase employee input in decision making and other evaluation and feedback opportunities (see page 88 Table 5.1 for a detailed list of approaches)

Limitations: Transferability from US setting.

WoE: Medium

Notes: Uses the “bucket metaphor” to explain recruitment: “The water level, which rises and falls with accession and attrition over time, frequently does not fill the bucket because the demand for officers exceeds the ability to meet it due to resource or other limitations.” (p:xvii).

Source 50: Orrick, D. W. (2008). Recruitment, retention, and turnover of police personnel: Reliable, practical, and effective solutions. Charles C Thomas Publisher.

Source type: Book Chapter

Aims: Overview of recruitment and retention from a US perspective. There are specific sections on age and requirements of different generations

Location: US.

Data from: NA

Sample details: NA

Summary/ Findings: Greater use of technology in recruitment. Younger applicants attracted by “exciting aspects” of policing which affect public perceptions at the point of recruitment. Argues for developing leadership skills for all recruits. Suggests work-life-balance a key consideration for younger recruits. Introduces ‘Generational Theory’ - argues that each generation has “peer personalities” (p61). Describes the importance of the “turning point” where one germination changes into another and suggests that this is such a moment. Describe Generation Y as “ambitious, confident, optimistic and energetic” (p71). Argues that Baby Boomers were more narcissistic compared to Generation Y who are more community-orientated. Suggests Generation Y have faced stricter standards on drug use, educational attainment etc. This generation is more comfortable with diversity but with “traditional” (p75) values). Lists approaches that are attractive to Generation Y:

• Employee referral programmes

• Development of a police ‘brand’

• Clear job expectations

• Highlight career expectations and educational incentives as part of ongoing education

• Expect that parents are part of the decision-making process and factor that into recruitment

For supervision practice, the author argues:

• Strong orientation programmes

• Goals for each individual

• Mentoring

• “Abundant amounts” (p74) of training

• Use of larger team orientation to address issues

• “Think Big” (p74) in that there is an expectation that young people will make a difference in their communities

• Expectation of “face time” with people in a leadership position within a flatter organisation

• Supervisors should not be too critical, abrupt or tough in feedback

• Recognise the importance of family responsibility

Author also cites the maturation process in which different ages have different life perspectives.

Limitations: Transferability from US setting.

WoE: High

1. In a wider human resource context, ‘coaching’ is also used alongside mentoring within workforce development. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)